

PEMBER LIBRARY ELEVATOR ADDITION PROJECT

In the July, 2014 and July 2015 annual meetings, the Pember's largest donor focused and directed the Pember Board to achieve two important things in the future. One was the purchase of the Carriage House Apartments and two was to create better access to the museum. Since 2001, this particular donor has contributed approximately \$1.3 million dollars to the Pember. In November, 2015, as a direct result of their guidance, the Carriage House Apartments were purchased and planning moved forward for the best access to the museum.

Several studies were begun to examine the best method of access to the museum at the most reasonable cost. The concept to modify the exterior ramp and build a chair lift inside was one concept and an elevator installation was another concept. The initial study was to improve the existing ramp to meet ADA compliance and employ a chair lift mounted inside the library for access into the museum. The ramp design concept was drawn and donated by David Holbrook, Joy Architects. The chair lift review was examined with Easy Lift - Albany, NY, Terry Farrigan. After careful reviews, this approach was rejected for a number of reasons. The existing ramp needed extensive modifications and anchor accommodations. The chair lift was rejected since it resulted in creating a very tight space on the stairs when others would be on foot in the same area. The aesthetics of a chair lift inside the Pember was most problematic and did not keep with the Victorian surroundings. The new building codes required a secondary egress from the museum in case of an emergency and this concept provided no option for a secondary egress. The chair lift supplier/installer, Easy Lift - Albany, NY rejected the chair lift concept because it would not meet ADA requirements. A chair lift installation is not an allowable use for commercial applications and is only a residential application. The conclusion was to study an elevator installation that met all ADA compliant regulations and new code guidelines for ingress and egress. A masonry construction design was developed and it was decided a masonry construction would satisfy all ADA requirements.

Three architectural firms were contacted, interviewed and asked to submit proposals for an elevator addition. Lacy Thaler Reilly Wilson Architects, Phinney Design Group and SD Atelier Architects submitted bids. SD Atelier Architects was selected after a Pember Board review and a contract was signed with SD Atelier Architects. SD Atelier Architects had a lower price for the project, a detailed design proposal for a masonry structure and employed the best CAD operator of all the bidders allowing quicker analysis in day-to-day execution. SD Atelier Architects did not have an enormous backlog of contracts at the time and agreed to work with the Pember's construction manager. In March, 2018, as part of its agreed scope of work, SD Atelier Architects conducted a pre-bid meeting for 6 interested general contractors from the greater Granville region. SD Atelier Architects, pursuant to their scope of work, handled all design and specification issues, pre-bid conferences, publication of bid dates, analysis of all general contractor bids and recommended selection of a successful bidder. Post bid, two firms were interviewed and the decision was made to select Bast Hatfield for a number of reasons. Bast Hatfield was an experienced masonry contractor, demonstrated a workable design interpretation plan and presented a timetable most suitable to the architect and owner. The masonry design featured two concrete boxes one inside the other structural connected and the Bast Hatfield team presented the best overall approach for installation. An AIA standard contract was negotiated and signed between Bast Hatfield and the Pember. Schroder-Rivers Engineers were selected to design the structural components for the project. Tatko Stone Corporation was selected as construction manager for the benefit of the Pember.

In May, 2018, the Department of Labor was contacted to provide an opinion as to the requirement if prevailing wages were required or not required for the elevator project. On May 30, 2018, Ray LaPlante, Jr., Northeast Supervisor for the Department of Labor issued a ruling that no prevailing wages applied to the elevator project. On June 4, 2018, the Village Board approved the construction of the Pember Elevator Addition Project at their board meeting 4-0. Paul Labas was absent. At the same board meeting, the Village Board approved the Department of Labor Ray LaPlante, Jr. letter establishing no prevailing wages applied to the Pember elevator project.

OMYA, Florence, Vermont was contacted because OMYA had the same Pittsford grey marble blocks used on the original exterior of the Pember building. These blocks came from the original quarry in Pittsford, Vermont and were in OMYA's inventory. After negotiations, OMYA representatives agreed to donate the blocks to the Pember for the elevator addition. Vermont Quarries, Inc. were contacted to purchase the match existing white marble blocks for the cut to size materials. Four companies, Gawet Marble, Johnson Marble, Champlain Stone and Les Pierres Technoprofil were contacted to bid the rock face and cut to size materials from the Pember purchased blocks. Each firm was selected for fabrication works based upon best price, delivery and compliance to specification guidelines of the project. The four firms invoiced the Pember directly and the Pember paid each firm directly.

On May 9, 2017 and May 10, 2017, Village Clerk Rick Roberts and Mayor Brian LaRose approved, signed, warranted and certified to DASNY the SAM \$100,000.00 grant from (Ret.) Senator Betty Little would be used specifically for Renovations to the Pember Library and Museum. The Pember subsequently received the DASNY grant totaling \$100,000.00. All money and all paperwork were directed through Village Clerk Rick Roberts. All grant money was spent for the purchase and installation of the elevator equipment known as DASNY Tasks 1-4. The Pember presented to the Village Clerk Rick Roberts the DASNY required Tasks 1-4 summarizing a full and accurate accounting of all invoices and records for DASNY verification and payment back to the Village. Mayor LaRose signed 2 of 4 Tasks and Mayor Paul Labas signed two of four Tasks. The elevator bidders were Bay State Elevator Co., Schindler Elevators, Northern Lifts and Otis/Albany, NY. Northern Lifts was selected based upon low bid, best warranty program and best conformance to the specification requirements developed by SD Atelier Architects.

Mayor Paul Labas and Granville resident John Freed have raised questions if Tatko Stone Corporation or Bob Tatko specifically made money from this project. For the record, neither Tatko Stone Corporation as construction manager, Bob Tatko, individually, or any company or person associated with Tatko made any money or profited in any manner from the Pember Elevator Addition Project. The Labas and Freed claims are false. Using Tatko's wide industry experience, Tatko was able to negotiate the most favorable purchase and fabrication prices for the benefit of the Pember and simply made the best quality material selections. Since 2014, Bob and Sarah Tatko have donated over \$40,000.00 to the Pember and Bob Tatko has donated over 8,000-man hours to renovate and improve the Pember buildings, programs and Preserve.

Pember Library & Museum ~ Elevator Project

Profit & Loss

All Transactions

Ordinary Income/Expense

Income

Annual Dinner -	\$1,525.00
Donations	\$105,371.54
Fundraiser	\$1,035.00
Grants	\$85,000.00
Grants and government contribut	\$100,947.45
Investments	\$22,292.91
Loan	\$7,500.00
Payment	\$2,955.00
Transferred	\$482,834.02

Total Income \$809,460.92

Expense

Advertising	\$259.36
Annual Dinner	\$420.26
Architect	\$29,564.02
Bank Fee	\$213.00
Building & Grounds	\$1,025.53
Building Materials	
Elevator	\$105,776.17
Marble	\$77,865.35
Building Materials - Other	\$8,220.54

Total Building Materials \$191,862.06

Business Expenses

Business Registration Fees	\$428.00
Business Expenses - Other	\$149.97

Total Business Expenses \$577.97

Cleaning \$886.45

Construction

Bast Hatfield	\$487,405.00
Construction - Other	\$45,992.37

Total Construction \$533,397.37

Consultant \$2,689.80

Cost Estimates \$1,400.00

Drafting \$1,215.00

Electrical \$4,149.84

Structural Engineer \$17,000.00

Facilities and Equipment

Equip Rental and Maintenance	\$4,434.00
Rent, Parking, Utilities	\$5.00

Facilities and Equipment - Other \$681.16

Total Facilities and Equipment \$5,120.16

Freight \$245.37

Grant expenses \$49.99

Hardware \$1,258.76

Insurance \$1,031.00

Legal Fees \$2,569.00

Loan Repayment \$7,573.69

Operations

Office \$406.93

Postage, Mailing Service \$15.91

Printing and Copying \$400.10

Supplies \$264.06

Telephone, Telecommunications \$720.33

Total Operations \$1,807.33

Security \$1,664.32

Transfers \$3,000.00

Travel and Meetings \$354.81

Total Expense \$809,335.09

Net Ordinary Income \$125.83

Net Income \$125.83